

л

ŧ

# National Electric Power Regulatory Authority Islamic Republic of Pakistan

NEPRA Tower, Attaturk Avenue (East), G-5/1, Islamabad. Tel: +92-51-9206500, Fax: +92-51-2600026 Web: www.nepra.org.pk, E-mail: registrar@nepra.org.pk

No. NEPRA/DG(M&E)/LAD-09/ 4074

March 22, 2024

Chief Executive Officer, Quetta Electric Supply Company (QESCO), Zarghoon Road, Quetta

# Subject: ORDER OF THE AUTHORITY IN THE MATTER OF SHOW CAUSE NOTICE ISSUED TO QESCO ON ACCOUNT OF FATAL ACCIDENTS OCCURRED DURING FY 2022-23

Please find enclosed herewith, the Order of the Authority (total 15 pages) in the subject matter for information and compliance.

Enclosure: Order of the Authority (total 15 Pages)

(Engr. Mazhar Iqbal Ranjha)



# National Electric Power Regulatory Authority

# <u>ORDER</u>

# IN THE MATTER OF SHOW CAUSE NOTICE ISSUED TO QESCO ON ACCOUNT OF FATAL ACCIDENTS OCCURRED DURING FY 2022-23

 Quetta Electric Supply Company Limited (QESCO) (the "Licensee") was granted a Distribution License (No. DL/08/2023 dated 09.05.2023) by the National Electric Power Regulatory Authority (the "Authority") for providing Distribution Services in its Service Territory as stipulated in its Distribution License, pursuant to section 21 of the Regulation of Generation, Transmission and Distribution of Electric Power Act, 1997 ("NEPRA Act").

# **Background:**

- As per Rule 7 of NEPRA Performance Standards (Distribution) Rules, 2005 (PSDR-2005), all Distribution Companies (DISCOs) are bound to submit an Annual Performance Report to the Authority every year. Further, Form 9 of PSDR 2005 states that DISCOs shall report each and individual incident on immeidtae basis. Accordingly, the DISCOs submitted the data/information to NEPRA regarding electrical incidents resulting in death/permanent disability/serious injury to members of staff or the general public that occurred in FY 2022-23.
- 3. During the review of data submitted by the Licensee, it was revealed that a total number of ten (10) fatalities, including both employees (04) and the general public (06), occurred within the service territory of the Licensee. This figure illustrates a concerning picture regarding efforts taken by the Licesnee to inculcate a safety culture in its service territory.

Moreover, according to Rule 4(g) of PSDR-2005, the Licesnee should establish and enforce appropriate rules, regulations, and operational procedures as outlined in its Distribution Code or relevant documents to ensure the safety of both its employees and the general public, however, it has failed to do so.

# Show Cause Notice:

5. The Authority took notice of the aforementioned fatal accidents and decided to initiate legal proceedings against the the Licensee under NEPRA Fine Regulations, 2021. Accordingly, NEPRA vide its letter dated August 30, 2023, served a Show Cause Notice (SCN) to the Licensee on account of ten (10) Fatal Accidents (4 Employees and 6 Public) that occurred during FY 2022-23 for violating Performance Standards, Distribution Code, Power Safety Code, and other applicable documents. The salient points of the said SCN are as follows

Si Cr



Page 1 of 15

WHEREAS, pursuant to section 21(2)(f) of the NEPRA Act, the Licensee is required to follow the performance standards laid down by the Authority for the distribution and transmission of electric power, including safety; and

- 3. WHEREAS, pursuant to Rule 4(g), of Performance Standards (Distribution) Rules, 2005, and clause SR 4 of Distribution Code, 2005:
  - i. All distribution facilities of a distribution company shall be constructed, operated, controlled and maintained in a manner consistent with the Distribution Code, Power Safety Code, Consumer Service Manual, and other applicable documents.
  - ii. A distribution company shall ensure that its distribution facilities do not cause any leakage of electrical current or step potential beyond a level that can cause harm to human life, as laid down in the relevant IEEE/IEC Standards; prevent accessibility of live conductors or equipment; and prevent development of a situation due to breakdown of equipment which results in voltage or leakage current that can cause harm to human life, property and general public including without limitation, employees and property of the distribution company.
  - iii. A distribution company shall implement suitable, necessary, and appropriate rules, regulations and working practices, as outlined in its Distribution Code or applicable documents, to ensure the safety of its staff and members of the public. This shall also include suitable training for familiarity and understanding of the rules, regulations, practices, and training to use any special equipment that may be required for such purposes including without limitation basic first aid training.

4. WHEREAS, pursuant to Clauses PSC-1, PSC-2, & PSC-6.3 of Power Safety Code:

#### PSC-1 Purpose:

The purpose of this safety code is to ensure that the licensee's networks are planned, developed, operated, and maintained in an efficient & safe way without compromising on safety of any kind related to the systems, personnel & others.

#### **PSC-2** General Instructions of Power Safety:

The licensee shall abide by the safety requirements as set out in Power Safety Code, Distribution Code, Power Safety Manual, Performance Standards (Distribution) Rules 2005, Grid Code & other applicable documents.

The licensee shall promote a healthy & safe culture and provide all employees, contractors, and the people concerned and the public with a safe & healthy place to work. The Licensee shall ensure that safe working is integrated into every aspect and area of business. Moreover, safety culture shall be based on personal leadership, collaboration, and involvement.



Page 2 of 15

The licensee shall adhere to the highest standards in all work practices so as to ensure protection of employees and any other affected by what licensee do. Each licensee shall ensure in day to day work that facilities/support programmers are provided to safeguard the health, welfare & well-being of their staff.

#### **PSC-6.3 General Provisions of Safety:**

The general provisions of safety shall be provided by each licensee covering the following:-

- The provisions for workers/operators to object to doing work on safety grounds
- The use & wearing of safety equipment & protective clothing
- Physical fitness & personal conduct of the worker before and during on job
- Arrangement and procedure of job briefing before the work is started
- Requirements to safe guard the public and property when work in progress
- Requirements for housekeeping in a safe working conditions
- Arrangements and requirements of fire protection
- Requirements, arrangements and use of proper tools and plants for the proper and safe storage lifting and carrying of different types of material
- Procedure and reporting requirements of patrolling of lines
- Procedure for tree trimming
- List of common protective devices and equipment used for the safety purposes.
- 6. The Licensee submitted its response vide its letter dated September 11, 2023, against the SCN served. The summarized points of the Licensee's response are narrated below:
  - i. It is submitted that in consonance with the Authority's directives, QESCO is fully committed and trying its level best to follow and enforce all sections of NEPRA Act, NEPRA Performance Standards (Distribution) Rules, and all clauses of the NEPRA Power Safety Code.
  - ii. By utilizing all the human and material resources, QESCO is committed to ensure standard distribution network as per SOPs, besides taking concrete steps in the removal of Safety hazards as per the directives of the Ministry of Energy (Power Division) in accordance with NEPRA Power Safety Code.
  - iii. Moreover, legal notices have also been served to those inhabitants of QESCO's territory who have constructed their houses, buildings, and plazas beneath or near the 11 kV as well as 66/132 kV Transmission Lines. The field formations have been given strict instructions to follow up on such types of cases and keep close liaisons with local administrative authorities to avoid further illegal construction of houses, buildings, plazas, etc, and consequently to save precious lives.



Page **3** of **15** 

iv. As far as the ten (10) fatalities that occurred during FY 2022-23 in QESCO's jurisdiction are concerned, SAIFI and SAIDI parameters are interrupted due to shortage of staff and high workload on remaining Line Staff which increases probability of accidents. Punishments have been awarded to all those officers/officials who were held responsible for four (04) fatalities of QESCO line staff. Further, it is added that six (06) public person fatalities occurred due to lack of awareness, substandard electrical wirings within homes, and unverified wiring test reports (issued by Electric Inspectors, Department of Energy, GoB) without considering the actual load requirement of the consumer premises.

# dearing;

1

- 7. Furthermore, in order to satisfy the requirement of law, the Authority decided to provide an opportunity for a hearing to the Licensee under NEPRA (Fine) Regulations, 2021, before further proceeding in the matter. Accordingly, the said hearing was held on October 17, 2023, wherein, the CEO of the Licensee along with his team made the following submissions:
  - i. CEO QESCO submitted brief details of the occurrences of the fatal accidents that occurred in QESCO's territory in FY 2022-23.
  - ii. As per the internal inquiry reports, concerned SDOs and LSs are responsible and guilty for the fatal accidents.
  - iii. Compensation to the legal heirs of the deceased employees has been provided by QESCO. However, no compensation has been provided to the heirs of deceased private persons, because their fatalities occurred due to their own negligence, within their homes.

# Summary of Preliminary Inquiry Reports:

8. It is relevant to mention that after getting information pertaining to each and individual case, the office of NEPRA Regional Office Quetta conducted preliminary inquiries and carried out a through evaluation of all relevant records including the internal inquiry reports submitted by the Licensee itself against the aforementioned ten (10) fatalities that occurred during FY 2022-23. The summary of the same is as under:

Sr. No.	Name of Victim(s)	Date of Incident	Category	Incident Description	Responsibility/ Reasons
1	Mr. Zahid-Imam	30.07.2022	Employee	The victim met with a Non-	QESCO
1	(ALM)			Fatal accident as he fell	
	1 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4			down on the ground while	<ul> <li>Lack of Safety</li> </ul>
1.1			1	descending from the HT	Measures/Culture
				pole as he was opening his	
		[		safety belt. Later he expired.	
2	Mr. Sadora Khan	16.03.2023	Employee	The victim while repairing a	QESCO
	(LM-I)			bush of 100KVA pad	
				mounted transformer, got	<ul> <li>Lack of Safety</li> </ul>
				electrocuted, and as a result,	Measures/Culture



Page 4 of 15

İ	:			he fell down on the ground and died	
3	Mr. Ghulam Nabi	24.04.2023	Public	The victim got electrocuted and died while illegally working on an 11kV	Others
			2	Baghbana-1 feeder emanating from the 132kV	
4	Mr. Abdullah	29.04.2023	Public	Baghbana grid station. The victim got electrocuted	Others
· ]	Khan Dawach			inside the premises of his	
				home while repairing the	
				wiring of his water pump	
				due to accidentally touching	
1				energized PVC wire as a	
	7 4 7 4 1 1 1	16.06.0000	<b>F</b> . 1	result he died on the spot	
5	Mr. Khalid	15.06.2023	Employee	The victim got electrocuted	QESCO
	Hussain (LM-II)			and fell down from a substation note during the	+ I cole - f Q - fortain
Ì				substation pole during the earthing process of the 33kV	<ul> <li>Lack of Safety Measures/Culture</li> </ul>
				Lehri line.	wicasures/Culture
6	Mr. Mubeen	17.07.2022	Public	The victim got electrocuted	QESCO
· .	Ahmad Jogezai		1 00/10	and died on the spot while	-
	Mr. Aboullai			coming in contact with the	
	letica Daviani			11 kV line at the rooftop of	
				Khurshid Khan Jogezai	
				Market which is located in	
				the main Bazar of Killa	
				Saifullah opposite Byco	
		00.00.000		petrol pump.	
7	Mr. Adnan Ali	26.09.2022	Public	The victim met with fatal	QESCO
				accident while coming in contact with the stay wire of	
				the pole which was carrying	
			ļ	a leakage current. As per the	
×.				record, the LT conductor	Estargit i duit
				attached to the insulator	• Improper Protection
				shackle slipped and came	System
	A Star Star Star			into contact with the D-Strip	
				of the insulator, causing a	1
				leakage current in stay wire.	
				Consequently, the current	
			ļ	passed through the stay	
		i i i		wire, and when the victim	
				touched same, he got electrocuted and lost his life.	
8	Mr. Feroz Khan	12.02.2023	Public	The victim got electrocuted,	Others
U	MILL A STUG INTIGHT			fell down from the HT pole,	
				and got seriously injured	
				while illegally reconnecting	
ز ه	1				
	M. Astrony	$\cap$			Dago E of 1F
	$\sim$ $\sim$			CPOWER REGU	Page 5 of 15
				1. YZ ~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~	
]		<b>۱</b>			
		N.			
S, and all the state of the sta		V	ELECT	NEPRA	

. -. . ...



77 •

				the HT Jumper of the 11KV City-I Feeder.	
9	Mr. Saeed Ahmed (LM-I)	23.02.2023	Employee	Electrocuted – No cause provided	-
10	Woman	23.12.2022	Public	A woman resident of the Airport Road area died in her own house due to an electric shock from a water geyser.	

Based on the aforementioned summary, the following is the final outcome:

Description	Number of	Responsibility		
	<b>Fatalities</b>	QESCO	Others.	
Employees	04	03	01	
Public	06	02	04	
Total	10	05	05	

# Findings/Analysis:

10

NEPRA Act and distribution license issued to all distribution companies impose a statutory obligation on the distribution licensees to follow safety standards laid down by the Authority. In this regard, reference is made to Section 21 of the NEPRA Act and Article 11 of the distribution license of the Licensee:

# Section 21(2) (f) NEPRA Act

The Licensee shall follow the performance standards laid down by the Authority for distribution and transmission of electric power, including safety, health, and environmental protection instructions issued by the Authority or any Governmental agency;

# Article 11 Distribution License - Compliance with Performance Standards

Compliance with Performance Standards – The Licensee shall conform to the relevant Performance Standards as may be prescribed by the Authority from time to time.

The Licensee is required to follow the design parameters of the distribution network and take all possible measures as laid down in the NEPRA Performance Standards Distribution Rules, Distribution Code, and Consumer Service Manual to ensure that there is no leakage of current from its distribution facilities to avoid any danger or harm to human life and property. Based on the details of individual cases briefed at length in the preceding paragraphs, the major findings of the NEPRA are as follows:

# 9.1. DETERIORATED DISTRIBUTION SYSTEM/DESIGN FAULT/

In the case of Mr. Adnan Ali, the victim met with a fatal accident while coming in contact with the stay wire of the pole which was carrying a leakage current. As per the record, the LT conductor attached to the insulator shackle slipped



Page 6 of 15

and came into contact with the D-Strip of the insulator, causing a leakage current in the stay wire. Consequently, the current passed through the stay wire, and when the victim touched same, he got electrocuted and lost his life.

NEPRA laws and applicable documents particularly Performance Standard Distribution Rules, Distribution Code, and Consumer Service Manual require a distribution licensee to ensure that its distribution facilities do not cause any leakage current and that its protection devices are properly installed and coordinated to ensure isolation of faulty circuits. In this regard, reference is inade to provisions of the relevant NEPRA laws:

# <u>NEPRA Performance Standards (Distribution) Rules</u> Rule 4(g), Overall Standards 7-Safety

*(i)* .....

(ii) A distribution company shall ensure that its distribution facilities do not cause any leakage of electrical current or step potential beyond a level that can cause harm to human life, as laid down in the relevant IEEE/IEC Standards; prevent accessibility of live conductors or equipment; and prevent development of a situation due to breakdown of equipment which results in voltage or leakage current that can cause harm to human life, property and general public including without limitation, employees and property of the distribution company.

(iii) ......

# **Distribution Code**

#### PR 1 Protection System Practices and System Co-ordination

The Licensee shall follow suitable and necessary provisions regarding protection system practices and co-ordination such as the following but not limited to achieve the aims of proper functioning of the distribution system of the Licensee at all times:

a. Protection co-ordination of distribution system, sub-transmission system and system up to the metering point of the User (wherever applicable). b. Intentions to protect the Licensees lines, sub-station facility and equipment against the effects of faults.

#### SR 4 Safety Management Criteria

α. ....

b. A distribution company shall ensure that its distribution facilities do not cause any leakage of Electrical Current or Step Potential beyond a level that can cause harm to human life, as laid down in the relevant IEEE/IEC Standards; prevent accessibility of live conductors or equipment; and prevent development of a situation due to breakdown of equipment which results in voltage or leakage current that can cause harm to human life, property and general public including without limitation, employees and property of the distribution company.

#### DDC 3 DESIGN PRINCIPLES

3.1 Specification of Equipment, Overhead Lines and Underground Cables a. The principles of design, manufacturing, testing and installation of Distribution Equipment, overhead lines and underground cables, including



Page 7 of 15

quality requirements, shall conform to applicable standards such as IEC, IEEE, Pakistan Standards or approved current practices of the Licensee.

b. The specifications of Equipment, overhead lines and cables shall be such as to permit the Operation of the Licensee Distribution System in the following manner;

i. within the safety limits as included in the approved Safety Code of the Licensee or the relevant provisions of the Performance Standards (Distribution);

# **<u>Consumer Service Manual</u>** Chapter 12 Safety and Security 12.2 Obligation of QESCO

QESCO shall monitor and implement the safety and security plan for consumers. The safety and security objectives can be achieved by adopting good engineering practice, including measures as described below:

12.2.1 Operation and maintenance of QESCO distribution system /Network shall be carried out only by the QESCO authorized and trained personnel. 12.2.2 QESCO system equipment, including overhead lines, poles/structures/towers underground cables, transformers, panels, cutouts, meters, service drops, etc. shall be installed and maintained in accordance with Grid Code, Distribution Code and other relevant documents.

In view of the foregoing, the Licensee has failed to discharge its statutory obligation to maintain safety standards and ensure that its protection system operates on time to prevent leakage of current, therefore, the Licensee has contravened Section 21(2)(f) of the NEPRA Act, Article 11 of the Distribution Licence read with Rule 4(g) of the NEPRA Performance Standards (Distribution) Rules, 2005, Clause 4 of the Safety Requirements of Distribution Code, Clause PR 1 of Protection System Requirements of Distribution Code, Clause DDC 3 of Design Code of Distribution Code and Chapter 12 of Consumer Service Manual.

# 9.2. LESS CLEARANCE OF HT LINES:

It has been observed that in the case of Mr. Mubeen Ahmad Jogezai, the victim got electrocuted and died on the spot while coming in contact with an 11 kV line at the rooftop of Khurshid Khan Jogezai Market which is located in the main Bazar of Killa Saifullah opposite Byco petrol pump. It is the prime responsibility of the Licensee to take notice of such constructions near/below its distribution/transmission lines to avoid any safety hazard as laid down in the Consumer Service Manual:

#### NEPRA Performance Standard (Distribution) Rules Rule 4(g) – Safety

(i) All distribution facilities of a distribution company shall be constructed, operated, controlled and remained in a manner consistent with the applicable documents.

ii) A distribution company shall ensure that its distribution facilities do not cause any leakage of electrical current or step potential beyond a level that can cause harm to human life, as laid down in the relevant IEEE/IEC Standards;

١,



Page 8 of 15

prevent accessibility of live conductors or equipment; and prevent development of a situation due to breakdown of equipment which results in voltage or leakage current that car, cause harm to human life, property and general public including without limitation, employees and property of the distribution company.

*iii)* A distribution company shall implement suitable, necessary, and appropriate rules, regulations and working practices, as outlined in its Distribution Code or applicable documents, to ensure the safety of its staff and members of the public. This shall also include suitable training for familiarity and understanding of the rules, regulations, practices, and training to use any special equipment that may be required for such purposes including without limitation basic first aid training.

#### **Distribution Code**

# SR 4, Safety Management Criteria

a. All distribution facilities of a distribution company shall be constructed, operated, controlled and remained in a manner consistent with the applicable documents.

b. A distribution company shall ensure that its distribution facilities do not cause any leakage of Electrical Current or Step Potential beyond a level that can cause harm to human life, as laid down in the relevant IEEE/IEC Standards; prevent accessibility of live conductors or equipment; and prevent development of a situation due to breakdown of equipment which results in voltage or leakage current that can cause harm to human life, property and general public including without limitation, employees and property of the distribution company.

c. A distribution company shall implement suitable, necessary, and appropriate rules, regulations and working practices, as outlined in its Distribution Code or applicable documents, to ensure the safety of its staff and members of the public. This shall also include suitable training for familiarity and understanding of the rules, regulations, practices, and training to use any special equipment that may be required for such purposes including without limitation basic first aid training.

Chapter 12 of the Consumer Service Manual obligates each distribution licensee to ensure that its overhead lines, poles, and structures are maintained at a clearance from ground and buildings to avoid any safety hazard. Further distribution licensee is duty-bound to issue notice in case of construction/extension of a building near distribution lines for violation of safety standards as laid down in the Consumer Service Manual and Distribution Code.

#### Chapter 12 Consumer Service Manual 12.2 Obligations of QESCO

QESCO shall monitor and implement the safety and security plan for consumers. The safety and security objectives can be achieved by adopting good engineering practice, including measures as described below:

12.2.1 Operation and maintenance of QESCO distribution system /Network shall be carried out only by the QESCO authorized and trained personnel.

12.2.2 QESCO system equipment, including overhead lines, poles/structures/towers underground cables, transformers, panels, cutouts, meters, service drops, etc. shall be installed and maintained in accordance with Grid Code, Distribution Code and other relevant documents.



Page 9 of 15

12.2.6 QESCO will issue a notice to the Consumer(s)/Person(s), in case of illegal construction, extension of building under or near the distribution/ transmission lines for violation of safety standards.

#### 12.4 SOME USEFUL SAFETY TIPS

12.4.6 Safe clearances from electricity conductors and equipment (e.g., hazardous extension of balconies at the upper stories of houses in mohallas which comes within close proximity of electric lines) must be maintained to avoid electrocution.

#### <u>Distribution Code</u>

#### SC 1- System Construction Code

Each Licensee shall prepare a comprehensive and exhaustive Operating / Construction manual in accordance with QESCO approved standard based on relevant international standards like IEC, IEEE, and ASI, Consumer Service Manual, Grid Code and Distribution Code dealing with all material aspects to the design specifications, safe constructing practices, and sound engineering technical principles for construction of Distribution System and connections to consumer installation/system. In particular due regard shall be had for the following but not limited to: -

a. Standard clearance of all voltage lines upto 132kV (vertical as well horizontal) from grounds, buildings, from each other, railway crossing, road crossing etc.

b. Maximum and minimum length of span of the lines of all the voltages upto 132kV at different locations and different areas.

#### DDC 2.2 Distribution Design Code

Design Criteria for Distribution Lines These criteria shall apply to all distribution and sub-transmission lines and to be operated and maintained by the Licensee up to and including 132kV for both overhead lines and underground cables. The lines shall be designed and constructed in accordance with relevant provisions of IEC Standard or subsequent approved standards applicable to overhead lines and under-ground cables.

#### DDC 3 DESIGN PRINCIPLES, Distribution Design Code

3.1 Specification of Equipment, Overhead Lines and Underground Cables a. The principles of design, manufacturing, testing and installation of Distribution Equipment, overhead lines and underground cables, including quality requirements, shall conform to applicable standards such as IEC, IEEE, Pakistan Standards or approved current practices of the Licensee.

b. The specifications of Equipment, overhead lines and cables shall be such as to permit the Operation of the Licensee Distribution System in the following manner;

*i.* within the safety limits as included in the approved Safety Code of the Licensee or the relevant provisions of the Performance Standards (Distribution);

Therefore, the Licensee has failed to prevent the construction of buildings dangerously close to the HT lines which have unsafe clearance with respect to the existing lines which ultimately led to the fatal accident. Therefore, the

der /



Page 10 of 15

Licensee has contravened Section 21(2)(f) of the NEPRA Act, Article 11 of the Distribution Licence read with Rule 4(g) of the NEPRA Performance Standards (Distribution) Rules, 2005, Clause 4 of the Safety Requirements of Distribution Code, DDC 2.2, DDC 3 of Design Code of Distribution Code, SC 1 of System Construction Code of Distribution Code, and Chapter 12 of Consumer Service Manual.

# 9.3. LACK OF SAFETY MEASURES/CULTURE:

During review of the preliminary inquiry reports and internal inquiry reports of the Licensee, it has been observed that three (03) fatalities of the Licensee occurred due to lack of safety measures/culture in the licensee's service territory. Further, details are following:

- 1. Mr. Zahid Imam
- 2. Mr. Sadora Khan

3. Mr. Khalid Hussain

The root cause of the accidents was casual attitude, risky decisions, supervisory lapses, carelessness, unprofessional behavior, and non-compliance with safety-related operating procedures by the Licensee's staff. Failure to ensure the issuance of PTW, improper PPE, and lack of supervision of work under safety precautions at the worksite are also contributing factors to the accidents. Moreover, the execution of work in an unplanned and haphazard manner is also a reason for the fatal accident.

Pursuant to performance standards laid down for the distribution licensees, the Licensee is required to implement suitable, necessary, and appropriate rules, regulations, and working practices, as outlined in the Distribution Code or applicable documents, to ensure the safety of its staff and members of the public. This shall also include suitable training for familiarity and understanding of the rules, regulations, practices, and training to use any special equipment that may be required to create awareness among employees and inculcate a safe environment.

# NEPRA Performance Standard (Distribution) Rules Rule 4(g) – Overall Standard (Safety)

(i) All distribution facilities of a distribution company shall be constructed, operated, controlled and remained in a manner consistent with the applicable documents.

ii) A distribution company shall ensure that its distribution fucilities do not cause any leakage of electrical current or step potential beyond a level that can cause harm to human life, as laid down in the relevant IEEE/IEC Standards; prevent accessibility of live conductors or equipment; and prevent development of a situation due to breakdown of equipment which results in voltage or leakage current that can cause harm to human life, property and general public including without limitation, employees and property of the distribution company.



Page 11 of 15

iii) A distribution company shall implement suitable, necessary, and appropriate rules, regulations and working practices, as outlined in its Distribution Code or applicable documents, to ensure the safety of its staff and members of the public. This shall also include suitable training for familiarity and understanding of the rules, regulations, practices, and training to use any special equipment that may be required for such purposes including without limitation basic first aid training.

#### Distribution Code SR 4, Safety Management Criteria

a. All distribution facilities of a distribution company shall be constructed, operated, controlled and remained in a manner consistent with the applicable documents.

b. A distribution company shall ensure that its distribution facilities do not cause any leakage of Electrical Current or Step Potential beyond a level that can cause harm to human life, as laid down in the relevant IEEE/IEC Standards; prevent accessibility of live conductors or equipment; and prevent development of a situation due to breakdown of equipment which results in voltage or leakage current that can cause harm to human life, property and general public including without limitation, employees and property of the distribution company.

c A distribution company shall implement suitable, necessary, and appropriate rules, regulations and working practices, as outlined in its Distribution Code or applicable documents, to ensure the safety of its staff and members of the public. This shall also include suitable training for familiarity and understanding of the rules, regulations, practices, and training to use any special equipment that may be required for such purposes including without limitation basic first aid training.

#### Clause PSC-1, PSC-2, & PSC-6.3 of Power Safety Code:

#### **PSC-1** Purpose:

The purpose of this safety code is to ensure that the licensee's networks are planned, developed, operated and maintained in an efficient & safe way without compromising on safety of any kind related to the systems, personnel & others.

#### **PSC-2** General Instructions of Power Safety:

The licensee shall abide by the safety requirements as set out in Power Safety Code, Distribution Code, Power Safety Manual, Performance Standards (Distribution) Rules 2005, Grid Code & other applicable documents.

The licensee shall promote a healthy & safe culture and provide all employees, contractors, and the people concerned and the public with a safe & healthy place to work. The Licensee shall ensure that safe working is integrated into every aspect and area of business. Moreover, safety culture shall be based on personal leadership, collaboration and involvement.



Page 12 of 15

The licensee shall adhere to the highest standards in all work practices so as to ensure protection of employees and any other affected by what licensee do. Each licensee shall ensure in day to day work that facilities/support programmers are provided to safe guard the health, welfare & wellbeing of their staff.

## **PSC-6.3** General Provisions of Safety:

The general provisions of safety shall be provided by each licensee covering the following:-

- The provisions for workers/operators to object to doing work on safety grounds
- o The use & wearing of safety equipment & protective clothing
- o Physical fitness & personal conduct of the worker before and during on job
- Arrangement and procedure of job briefing before the work is started
- o Requirements to safe guard the public and property when work in progress
- Requirements for housekeeping in a safe working conditions
- o Arrangements and requirements of fire protection
- Requirements, arrangements and use of proper tools and plants for the proper and safe storage lifting and carrying of different types of material
- o Procedure and reporting requirements of patrolling of lines
- Procedure for tree trimming
- List of common protective devices and equipment used for the safety purposes.
- 10. The Licensee has interalia, submitted that in consonance with the Authority's directives, it is fully committed and trying its level best to follow and enforce all sections of NEPRA Act, NEPRA Performance Standards (Distribution) Rules, and all clauses of NEPRA Power Safety Code. The Licensee has further submitted that it is utilizing all the human and material resources and committed to ensure standard distribution network as per SOPs, besides taking concrete steps in removal of Safety hazards as per the directives of Ministry of Energy (Power Division) in accordance with NEPRA Power Safety Code.

The submissions of the Licensee have been considered by the Authority and it is observed that the aforementioned claims of the Licensee does not merit consideration and realistically it is doing nothing to take concrete steps/efforts to remove safety hazards. If the Licensee is fully committed to follow all the rules and codes set by the Authority, then there should have been zero fatal accidents in its territory, whereas the fact is around thirty-eight (38) fatalities occurred in last five years which raises some serious concerns about the effectiveness of the Licensee's distribution system. Therefore, the submissions of the Licensee are baseless.

11. The Licensee has submitted that legal notices have also been served to those inhabitants of the Licensee's territory who have constructed their houses, buildings, and plazas beneath or near the 11 kV as well as 66/132 kV Transmission Lines. The field formations have been given strict instructions to follow up on such types of cases and keep close liaison with local administrative authorities so as to avoid further illegal construction of houses, buildings and plazas, etc and consequently to save precious lives.

. 1



Page 13 of 15

The submissions of the Licensee have been examined by the Authority and observes that despite the aforementioned claims of the Licensee, still fatalities have occurred due to coming in contact with nearby HT/LT Lines. It appears that no further action has been taken by the Licensee to clear such types of hazards i.e., re-routification of lines having less clearance with respect to buildings except serving notices. The Licensee should have disconnected supply or lodged FIRs against those who have illegally constructed their building near to already existing HT/LT Lines. Therefore, the steps taken by the Licensee are inadequate, and NEPRA is constrained to believe that the Licensee has failed to comply with safety standards prescribed in NEPRA rules, regulations, and codes.

12. The Licensee has submitted that, as far as the ten (10) fatalities that occurred during FY 2022-23 in the Licensee's Jurisdiction are concerned, SAIFI and SAIDI parameters are interrupted due to shortage of staff and high workload on remaining Line Staff which increases the probability of accidents. The Licensee has further submitted that punishments have been awarded to all those officers/officials who were held responsible for four (04) fatalities of the Licensee line staff. However, six (06) public persons died due to lack of awareness, substandard electrical wiring within homes, and unverified wiring test reports (issued by Electric Inspectors, Department of Energy, GoB) without considering the actual load requirement of the consumer premises.

The submissions of the Licensee have been thoroughly examined by the Authority and it is observed that punishment to the responsible officers is not the solution to the actual problems. The Licensee is required to adopt the safety culture in true letter and spirit which it has failed to do so. With regard, to the argument of the Licensee regarding fatalities of public persons due to lack of awareness, substandard wiring, and unverified wiring test reports, it is clarified that the submissions of the Licensee are not based on factual position. According to preliminary reports submitted by the Regional Office, Quetta, two fatalities out of six public persons occurred due to negligence of the Licensee. The reports reveal that one person was electrocuted due to breaking and subsequent touching of conductor with the victim, whereas, the second one was died due to coming in contact with the line having less clearance. This again shows the deterioration of the Licensee's distribution system and poor maintenance activities.

13. In conclusion, the Licensee is supposed to provide electric services in its territory in a safe and reliable manner, however, it has failed to do so, which is a clear violation of the terms and conditions of its Distribution Licence and NEPRA Laws. The above incidents reveal that the Licensee has failed to discharge its statutory obligations to maintain safety standards and ensure that distribution facilities are constructed, operated, and maintained in a safe manner. Therefore, the Licensee has contravened the above-stated provisions of the NEPRA laws.

# 14. Decision

1.

14.1. Keeping in view the submissions of the Licensee, the evidence available on record, and provisions of relevant NEPRA laws and terms and conditions of distribution license issued to the Licensee, the Authority hereby rejected the response of the Licensee against the served Show Cause Notice dated August



Page 14 of 15

30, 2023, and imposed a fine of Rs 12.5 Millions on the Licensee under the NEPRA Act, and NEPRA (Fine) Regulations, 2021 on account of noncompliance by the Licensee with NEPRA Act, Terms & Conditions of its License, Performance Standards (Distribution) Rules 2005, Distribution Code, Power Safety Code, Consumer Service Manual and other applicable documents.

The Authority has also observed that the Licensee gives compensation of PKR 3.5 million to the families of its employees in case of their fatal accident along with a job to next of kin. However, the Authority has also noted that the Licensee has not given any compensation to the members of bereaved families of public persons who lost their lives due to the above-mentioned contraventions of the law by the Licensee. Therefore, the Authority hereby directs the Licensee to give compensation to the deceased families equal to the amount being given to its employees' family and provide jobs to their next of kins. Further, the Licensee shall submit documentary evidence of its compliance in this regard to the satisfaction of the Authority within a period of two months.

#### AUTHORITY

Rafique Ahmed Shaikh

14.2.

Engr. Maqsood Anwar Khan Member (Licensing)

Mathar Niaz Rana (nsc) Member (Tariff & Finance)

Amina Ahmed Member (Law)

Waseem Mukhtar Chairman

Dated 2d/03 <u>/</u>, 2024



Page 15 of 15