

Consumer Affairs Department

National Electric Power Regulatory Authority

ISLAMIC REPUBLIC OF PAKISTAN
NEPRA Head Office Ataturk Avenue (East),
Sector G-5/1, Islamabad.

Ph: 051-2013200, Fax: 051-2600021

TCD.04/ -2024 January 5, 2024

Chief Executive Officer, Faisalabad Electric Supply Company (FESCO) Abdullah Pur, Canal Bank Road, <u>Fa</u>isalabad.

Subject:

DECISION IN THE MATTER OF COMPLAINT FILED BY MR. MUHAMMAD TAHAWAR ASIF UNDER SECTION 39 OF THE REGULATION OF GENERATION, TRANSMISSION AND DISTRIBUTION OF ELECTRIC POWER ACT, 1997 AGAIST K-ELECTRIC REGARDING DETECTION BILL (Ref # 24-13242-5200703)

Please find enclosed herewith decision of Consumer Complaints Tribunal dated January 04, 2023 regarding the subject matter and compliance report within fifteen (15) days, positively.

Encl: As above

(Muhammad Abid) Assistant Director (CAD)

Copy to:

- 1. GM (C&CS), FESCO, Abdullah Pur, Canal Bank Road, <u>Faisalabad</u>.
- Assistant Director, NEPRA Regional Office, Plaza C-6B, College Road Faisalabad.
- Mr. Tahawar Asif
 Awami Street, Samundri Road
 Tehsil & District Faisalabad.
 Ph: 0300-8667720 & 0300-9651269



BEFORE THE NATIONAL ELECTRIC POWER REGULATORY AUTHORITY (NEPRA)

Complaint No. FESCO-FSD-27700-08-23

Mr. Muhammad Tahawar Asif Awami Street, Samundri Road Tehsil & District Faisalabad. Complainant

VERSUS

Faisalabad Electric Supply Company (FESCO)

Abdullah Pur, Canal Bank Road, Faisalabad.

..... Respondent

Date of Hearing:

October 04, 2023

November 13, 2023

On behalf of

Complainant:

1) Mr. Muhammad Tahawar Asif

Respondent:

1) Mr. Arslan Iqbal, XEN (Opr), FESCO

Subject:

DECISION IN THE MATTER OF COMPLAINT FILED BY MR. MUHAMMAD TAHAWAR ASIF UNDER SECTION 39 OF THE REGULATION OF GENERATION, TRANSMISSION AND DISTRIBUTION OF ELECTRIC POWER ACT, 1997 AGAIST K-ELECTRIC REGARDING DETECTION BILL (Ref # 24-13242-5200703)

DECISION

This decision shall dispose of the complaint filed by Mr. Muhammad Tahawar Asif (hereinafter referred to as the "Complainant") against Faisalabad Electric Supply Company (hereinafter referred to as the "Respondent" or "FESCO"), under Section 39 of the Regulation of Generation, Transmission and Distribution of Electric Power Act, 1997 (hereinafter referred to as the "NEPRA Act").

- 2. NEPRA received a complaint from Mr. Muhammad Tahawar Asif dated August 16, 2023 wherein the Complainant submitted that an exorbitant bill of 53440 units amounting to Rs. 1,363,106/- was charged by FESCO during the month of December, 2022 as a difference of units on the pretext of slowness of billing meter in comparison with the backup meter installed against his premises despite the fact that the backup meter was not duly calibrated and the corresponding reading record was also not maintained by FESCO. The Complainant further submitted that the disputed bill has been charged on account of the slowness for an indefinite period inconsiderate of the fact both the meters were previously checked by FESCO during June, 2022. The matter was taken up with FESCO whereby FESCO was directed to defer the remaining disputed amount as the partial amount of Rs. 337,451/- and the actual bills for the succeeding months were already paid by the Complainant.
- 3. As a way to further examine the matter, two (2) Nos. of hearings were also held at NEPRA Head Office, Islamabad on October 04, 2023 and November 13, 2023 whereby the matter was discussed in detail in attendance of both the parties.

- 4. The case has been examined in detail in light of the record made so available by parties, arguments advanced during the hearing and applicable law. Following has been observed:
 - (i) The Complainant's industrial premises having electricity connection installed against reference number (24-13242-5200703) located at Awami Street, Samundri Road, Fasialabad was charged a bill of 53440 units amounting to Rs. 1,363,106/- by FESCO during December, 2022 on account of the billing meter slowness in contrast with the backup meter.
 - (ii) Perusal of the documentary evidence submitted by FESCO and the Complainant reveals that the Complainant's meters (i.e. billing & backup) were checked by M&T department, FESCO on December 12, 2022 whereby a difference of total units from both the meters was recorded as 53440 units which were segregated for the month of December, 2022 and the remaining 39520 units were charged as detection bill against the Complainant on account of 33.3% slowness of the billing meter designated as one (1) phase dead. However, the same metering equipment was previously checked by M&T Department, FESCO on June 07, 2022 and a difference of 11473 units from both the meters was also noticed. FESCO should have removed the discrepancy immediately but the same was not done. However, FESCO declared the backup meter as billing meter and the impugned (old billing) meter has not yet been replaced.
 - (iii) According to clause 4.3.3 (c) of Consumer Service Manual (CSM), if the impugned metering installation should prove to be incorrect during the checking(s), DISCO shall install a "correct meter" immediately or within two billing cycles if meters are not available. In case slowness is established, DISCO shall enhance multiplying factor for charging actual consumption till replacement of the defective metering installation.
 - (iv) Hence, the former M&T report dated June 24, 2022 essentially overshadowed by the later M&T report dated December 19, 2022 and suggest the negligence of the concerned FESCO officials whereby the Complainant's defective meter was neither replaced nor the multiplying factor was enhanced for slowness while the wrong/less electricity consumption was allowed to accumulate over (6) months and suddenly an exorbitant number of units were levied against the Complainant in an unjustified manner. Moreover, the same further corroborates the fact that both the meters were deliberately declared healthy on the M&T report dated June 24, 2022 in spite of the stark difference in total meter readings while the billing meter's slowness also escalated upto 33.3% over the period of (6) months due to advertent delay on the part of the concerned FESCO officials which caused the charging of excessive bills during December, 2022.
 - (v) Hence, underlining the inconsistent M&T reports and deliberate delay in rectifying the meter defectiveness does not merit the charging of detection bill on the basis of back up meter reading. However, acknowledging the fact that the billing meter was essentially slow in recording actual consumption for unascertainable time period suggest the charging of detection bill as per the clause 4.3.3 (c)(ii) of CSM which provides that charging of a bill for the quantum of energy lost if any, because of malfunctioning of metering installation shall not be more than two previous billing cycles.
- 5. Foregoing in view, following is concluded:
 - (i) FESCO is directed to withdraw detection bill of 39520 units alongwith Late Payment Surcharge (LPS), if any being unjustified.
 - (ii) First checking of metering equipment was took place on June 07, 2022 whereby meter was declared slow, therefore, FESCO is directed to charge due slowness for previous two months prior to June 07, 2022 and to enhance Page 2 of 3



- multiplying factor (M.F) w.e.f. June, 2022 to September 2022 to recover the quantum of energy lost due to slowness.
- (ii) Second checking took place on December 12, 2022 whereby the meter was found 33.3% slow, therefore, FESCO should charge 33.3% slowness for previous two months prior to December 12, 2022 till the backup meter was declared as billing meter.
- A new healthy meter be installed in accordance with relevant provisions of (iii) Consumer Service Manual (CSM).
- 6. Compliance report be submitted fifteen (15) days, positively.

(Lashkar Khan Qambrani)

Member, Consumer Complaints Tribunal/ Director (CAD)

(Muhammad Irfan ul Haq)

Member, Consumer Complaints Tribunal/

Assistant Legal Advisor

(Naweed Illahi Shaikh)

Convener, Consumer Complaints Tribunal/

Director General (CAD)

Islamabad, January of