## National Electric Power Regulatory Authority

ISLAMIC REPUBLIC OF PAKISTAN

NEPRA Head Office

Ataturk Avenue (East) Sector G-5/1, Islamabad. Ph:051-2013200, Fax: 051-2600021

# Consumer Affairs Department

TCD 05/2752 -2025 July 10, 2025

Chief Executive Officer (CEO), Lahore Electric Supply Company (LESCO), 22-A, Queen's Road <u>Lahore</u>.

Subject: DECISION IN THE MATTER OF COMPLAINT FILED BY MR. AMJAD ALI SHEIKH, CHIEF CONSULTANT (UTILITY COMPLIANCE) ZONG, CMPAK LIMITED, UNDER SECTION 39 OF THE REGULATION OF GENERATION, TRANSMISSION AND DISTRIBUTION OF ELECTRIC POWER ACT, 1997 AGAINST LESCO REGARDING EXCESSIVE BILLING (A/C# 24 11452 0155000).

LESCO-NHQ-24178-05-23

Please find enclosed herewith the decision of the NEPRA Complaints Resolution Committee (CRC) dated July 10, 2025, regarding the subject matter for necessary action and compliance within twenty (20) days.

### Encl: As above

Copy to:

- Chief Engineer/Customer Services Director, LESCO, 22-A, Queen's Road, <u>Lahore</u>.
- 2. Director (Commercial), LESCO, 22-A, Queen's Road, <u>Lahore</u>.
- Incharge Central Complaint Cell, LESCO & -Focal Person to NEPRA, LESCO, 22-A, Queens Road, <u>Lahore</u>. 042-99204859
- Executive Engineer/XEN (Operation),
   Badami Bagh Division,
   132-KV Rustam Grid Station Sheikhupura Road,
   Lahore.
- Mr. Amjad Ali Sheikh,
   Chief Consultant (Utility Compliance),
   ZONG, CMPak Limited,
   113/15, Quaid-e-Azam Industrial Estate,
   Kotlakhpat, <u>Lahore</u>.
   0312-8237237

(Muhammad Abid)
Assistant Director (CAD)
NEPRA
Islamabad

(CAO)



#### BEFORE THE

# NATIONAL ELECTRIC POWER REGULATORY AUTHORITY

#### (NEPRA)

Complaint No. LESCO-NHQ-24178-05-23

.Complainant

.Respondent

age 1 | 3

Mr. Amjad Ali Shiekh

Zong CM Pak Limited, 113/15 Quaid-e-Azam Industrial Estate, Kot Lakhpat Lahore.

Versus

Lahore Electric Supply Company (LESCO)

22-A, Queens Road, Lahore.

Date of Hearing:

April 23, 2024

June 06, 2024

September 24, 2024

On behalf of:

Complainant:

1) Mr. Huzaifa Rafiq

2) Mr. Muddasir Rasheed

Respondent:

1) Mr. Kashif Imran Addl. XEN (Operation), LESCO

2) Mr. Mazhar Javed SDO (Operation), LESCO

Subject: <u>DECISION IN THE MATTER OF COMPLAINT FILED BY MR. AMJAD ALI SHIEKH UNDER SECTION 39 OF THE REGULATION OF GENERATION, TRANSMISSION AND DISTRIBUTION OF ELECTRIC POWER ACT, 1997 AGAINST LESCO REGARDING EXCESSIVE BILLING (REF 24 11152 0155000).</u>

#### **DECISION**

This decision shall dispose of the complaint filed by Mr. Amjad Ali Shiekh (he einafter referred to as the "Complainant") against Lahore Electric Supply Company (hereinafter referred to as the "LESCO") under Section 39 of the Regulation of Generation, Transmission and Distribution of Electric Power Act, 1997 (hereinafter referred to as the "NEPRA Act").

2. Brief fact of the case are that NEPRA received a complaint from the Complainant wherein the Complainant submitted that commercial connection installed against reference number (24-11152-0155000) was charged excessive bills by LESCO based on the wrong readings over the period of several prior months. The Complainant requested to correct the bills and replace the defective meter, upon which, the matter was taken up with LESCO whereby LESCO vide letter dated. June 08, 2023 submitted that the meter has been processed for accuracy/data retrieval. On receipt of the Complainant's rejoinder & in order to analyze the matter, hearings was held on April 23 & June 06, 2023 at NEPRA Head office, Islamabad during which both the parties agreed to resolve the matter amicably, however, it was not materialized that led to subsequent hearing at the same venue on September 24, 2024 whereby matter was analyzed in a detailed manner. Upon query, LESCO official failed to submit record of meter reading snaps relevant to the disputed billing cycles and data retrieval report of the disputed meter.

CRC Decision: Mr. Amjad Ali Shaikh vs LESCO (LESCO-NHQ-24178-05-23)

- The case has been examined in detail in light of the record made so available by parties, arguments advanced during the hearings and applicable law. Following has been observed:
  - i. The Complainant's connection having meter installed against reference number (24-11152-0155000) located in Shadbagh, District Lahore got replaced by LESCO during October, 2023. The dispute agitated by the Complainant was that the wrong bills in contrast with the actual meter readings on site have been charged by LESCO prior to the meter replacement since the year 2022. The Complainant prayed for correction of disputed bills on basis of data retrieval report or future consumption of replaced meter.
  - ii. Perusal of documentary evidence reveals that LESCO remained unable to provide the snaps of actual readings of Complainant's meter for the disputed months. Moreover, LESCO could not submit data retrieval report of defective meter despite allowance of considerable time period. Clause 6.1.3 of the Consumer Service Manual (CSM) provides that taking snapshots of meter readings of all consumer categories is mandatory and meter readings shall be taken through mobile snapshots/ hand held units. The same has been aimed to priorities correct feeding of the meter readings for consumer perusal and collection of previous snap shots for at least twelve months for resolution any dispute arises out of suspicious billing. However, the same has not been followed by LESCO in instant matter ensuing perusal of consumption history of the Complainant's connection for an informed decision.
  - iii. The billing consumption history of the Complainant is as under:

٠,

Month/year	2020 (Units)	2021 (Units)	2022 (Units)	2023 (Units)	2024 (Units)
Jan	8240	14160	16840	• 25340	5081
Feb	13660	15340	16460	30000	5012
Mar	8300	15540	18300	45440	6260
Apr	7420	16200	18700	71840	6866.
May	9320	16440	20060	20060	7845
Jun	6620	15160	17540	17540	7736
lut	16540	15200	22780	22780	7709
Aug	13720	14820	22680	22680	7816 .
Sep	14640	21100	22080	22440	6893
Oct	15560	17660	23660	14405 MCO	6741
Nov	10380	15960	24460	6839	6474
Dec	15340	16300	27700	4144	6713
Total	139740	193880	251260	303508	81146-
Average	11645	16157	20938	25292	6762

Scrutiny of the Complainant's billing history divulge that the monthly average consumption remained around or predominantly less than 20000 units during the calendar years of 2020, 2021 and 2024, however, month-wise consumption suddenly rose up to 45440 and 71840 units during March and April, 2023 respectively reflecting huge disparity. It is a matter of record that the MDIs charged during the above mentioned three billing cycles remained almost identical which does not conform to huge consumption difference in the consecutive months. The same creates huge discrepancy on the part of LESCO officials and raises suspicion over charging of bills during the calendar year of 2023 compounded with the fact that none record of reading snaps and data retrieval report was submitted by LESCO.

iv. The analysis of undisputed consumption after replacement of the meter during November, 2023 till December, 2024 reveals monthly average of 6581 units over the period of (14) months which further casts down over the consumption

CRC Decision: Mr. Amjad Ali Shaikh vs LESCO (LESCO-NHQ-24178-05-23)

charged during the year 2022 as claimed by the Complainant. In conjunction with the fact that the sanctioned load remained same during the overall period; it is of considered approach to translate the undisputed future monthly consumption since the meter replacement over the disputed period of consumption to meet the ranks of justice. It is pertinent to mention here that instant complaint was submitted before NEPRA during May, 2023 which ensue that the period of dispute cannot be allowed to remained non-truncated and on the wish & will of the Complainant as he was also responsible to watch and ward the reading charged to ensure the correct charging of bills as per meter snaps and report any discrepancy to LESCO at the earliest.

- According to Rule (3) of NEPRA Complaint Handling and Dispute Resolution (Procedure) Rules, 2015, a complaint shall be filed within one year from the accrual of the cause of action, however, the Complaint was filed with NEPRA in May, 2023. Hence, disputed period is required to be reduced one year from the month of filing of the complaint i.e. June, 2022 to May, 2023.
- Foregoing in view, LESCO is directed to revise all the bills charged during period i.e. June, 2022 to May, 2023 in accordance with the healthy average consumption of new meter installed in October, 2023 and overhaul the Complainant's account accordingly Compliance report be submitted within twenty (20) days, positively.

(Lashkar Khan Qambrani)

(Muhammad Irfan ul Haq)

Member, Complaints Resolution Committee/ Director (CAD)

Member, Complaints Resolution Committee/ Assistant Legal Advisor (CAD)

> NEPRA Islamabad

(Naweed Illahi Shaik

AFFAIRS O Convener, Complaints Resolution Committee

Director General (CAD)

Islamabad, July 10, 2025

14

i.i.

44